

Digitalization In Education and Its Impact on Stakeholders: A Comprehensive Analysis

Bhavna Talreja

Ph.D.Scholar
Shri Ramdeobaba College of Engineering and Management

Dr. Abhijeet Agadhe

Associate Professor, Shri Ramdeobaba College of Engineering and Management Nagpur

Dr. Anant Deogaonkar

Assistant Professor, Shri Ramdeobaba College of Engineering and Management Nagpur

Dr. Pooja Bhutda

Director - Innovative Hydrocarbons India Private Limited, Nagpur, Founder the Trio Consultants

Abstract: Digitalisation has transformed the education domain, revolutionising the manner in which knowledge is imparted, accessed, and disseminated. This extensive examination explores the influence of digitalisation in education on diverse stakeholders, encompassing learners, educators, educational establishments, and decision-makers. The investigation examines the advantages and obstacles linked with digitalisation, emphasising the potential prospects for enhanced learning results, advanced teaching techniques, and heightened availability to education. It additionally tackles the worries connected to fairness, confidentiality, and the digital gap, and deliberates approaches to alleviate these concerns. By scrutinising the encounters and viewpoints of diverse stakeholders, this examination aims to offer a comprehensive comprehension of the manifold consequences of digitalisation in education and its ramifications for the future.

Keywords: Digitalization, Education, Stakeholders, Students, Teachers, Educational institutions, Policymakers, Learning outcomes, Pedagogical methods, Accessibility, Equity, Privacy, Digital divide.

Introduction:

Digitisation has become an omnipresent influence across diverse sectors, encompassing education. The incorporation of digital technologies and instruments in the educational terrain has resulted in noteworthy changes in teaching and learning methodologies. This segment furnishes a context on the rise of digitalisation in education and underscores its importance in moulding the future of education.

The swift progression of digital technologies has enabled the formation and spread of educational material in manners that were formerly inconceivable. The expansion of internet

connectivity, portable gadgets, and digital platforms has unlocked fresh pathways for accessing knowledge and participating in educational endeavours. Digital transformation in education encompasses a variety of endeavours, such as web-based learning platforms, electronic textbooks, interactive resources, simulated classrooms, and educational administration systems.

The importance of digitalisation in education resides in its capacity to tackle diverse obstacles and enrich the educational encounter for all parties involved. It provides chances for customised and flexible learning, encouraging active involvement

and self-guided learning among students. Digital instruments empower educators to investigate groundbreaking instructional methodologies and deliver prompt feedback to learners, thus enhancing educational achievements. Educational establishments reap advantages from heightened efficacy in managerial duties and enhanced availability to scholastic assets.

Purpose and Objectives:

The objective of this research article is to thoroughly examine the influence of digitalisation in education on diverse stakeholders, encompassing learners, educators, educational establishments, and decision-makers. Through scrutinising the encounters, viewpoints, and anxieties of these stakeholders, the investigation endeavours to furnish understandings into the diverse repercussions of digitalisation and its ramifications for the forthcoming of education.

The specific objectives of the research paper are as follows:

1. To assess the benefits and challenges associated with digitalization in education.
2. To explore the impact of digitalization on learning outcomes and pedagogical methods.
3. To examine the accessibility and inclusivity aspects of digitalization in education.
4. To analyze the concerns related to equity, privacy, and the digital divide in the context of digital education.
5. To identify strategies and best practices to mitigate the challenges and maximize the benefits of digitalization in education.

Digitalization in Education: Stakeholder Perspectives

Students:

- Influence on learning experiences and results: The incorporation of digital tools and resources in education can enrich students' learning experiences by offering interactive and captivating learning materials. It might additionally enable

customised and flexible learning approaches, resulting in enhanced learning results.

- Modifications in student involvement and drive: Digitalisation has the potential to cultivate dynamic student participation through interactive exercises, diverse media materials, and cooperative learning platforms. It might additionally enhance motivation by providing chances for self-directed learning and investigation.
- Obstacles and possibilities for student achievement: Digital transformation presents both hurdles and prospects for student triumph. Obstacles might encompass availability of technology, proficiency in digital literacy, and probable diversions. Nevertheless, it additionally offers possibilities for self-guided learning, entry to a more extensive array of educational materials, and the cultivation of digital proficiency abilities.

Teachers:

- Alterations in pedagogical approaches and techniques: Digitalisation revolutionises pedagogical approaches by facilitating blended learning, inverted classrooms, and virtual collaborations. It enables educators to embrace student-focused methodologies, individualised teaching, and varied evaluations.
- Professional growth and instruction necessities: Educators necessitate continuous professional growth and instruction to proficiently incorporate digital resources into their pedagogical approaches. They require assistance in cultivating digital proficiency abilities, formulating captivating internet exercises, and harnessing educational technology to amplify student learning.
- Difficulties and advantages of digital tools and resources: Although digital tools present a plethora of advantages, such as enabling personalised instruction and delivering instantaneous feedback, they

also present obstacles. These obstacles encompass the requirement for technical assistance, guaranteeing fair access to technology, and manoeuvring through an extensive assortment of accessible resources.

Administrators and Institutions:

- Modifications in educational policies and approaches: Digitalisation in education requires the formulation of fresh policies and approaches that tackle the incorporation of technology, data confidentiality, and virtual learning. It necessitates establishments to modify their syllabus, evaluation techniques, and educator preparation initiatives correspondingly.
- Infrastructure and resource prerequisites: Organisations must allocate funds towards sturdy technological infrastructure, fast internet connectivity, and digital gadgets to bolster digitalisation endeavours. They also need to assign resources for software permits, internet platforms, and professional growth endeavours.
- Consequences for institutional administration and decision-making: Digitalisation influences decision-making procedures linked to financial planning, allocation of resources, and development of educational programmes. It necessitates administrators to guarantee fair access to digital assets, foster digital literacy campaigns, and uphold a culture of novelty and cooperation.

Parents and Guardians:

- Role in facilitating digital education: Parents play a pivotal role in facilitating their children's digital education by granting access to technology, establishing an enabling learning atmosphere at home, and supervising their child's online engagements.
- Worries and obstacles in navigating digital education: Parents might have anxieties

regarding their child's online security, screen time regulation, and the calibre of online educational materials. They might also encounter difficulties in manoeuvring digital platforms and comprehending the evolving educational terrain.

- Involvement with schools and instructors: Digitalisation offers possibilities for enhanced communication and involvement among guardians, schools, and educators. Parents can engage in virtual parent-educator meetings, obtain online progress updates, and cooperate with instructors to bolster their child's educational voyage.

Society and Economy:

- Influence on labour force enhancement and skills disparity: Digitalisation in education has ramifications for labour force enhancement by equipping students with the digital proficiencies and aptitudes necessary in the contemporary employment sphere. It can aid in bridging the expertise disparity and equip individuals for the digital marketplace.
- Societal fairness and entry to education: Digitalisation holds the capability to amplify entry to education, notably for marginalised communities and distant regions. Nevertheless, it further aggravates prevailing social fairness concerns, as the availability of technology and internet access might not be impartial for every student.
- Economic ramifications of digitalisation in education: Digitalisation may have economic consequences by revolutionising the education sector, generating fresh employment prospects in educational technology, and propelling economic expansion through the advancement of digitalized educational goods and services.

By taking into account these stakeholder viewpoints, a thorough examination of the influence of digitalisation in education can be accomplished, illuminating the possibilities,

obstacles, and potential approaches for maximising the advantages and tackling the worries linked with digitalisation in education.

Benefits and Opportunities of Digitalization in Education:

1. **Augmented Learning Experiences:** Digitalisation provides interactive and captivating learning experiences through multimedia assets, simulations, and virtual reality instruments. It encourages lively engagement, discerning thought, and ingenuity among students.
2. **Individualised Education:** Digital resources facilitate adaptable learning, enabling students to acquire knowledge at their preferred speed and obtain customised evaluations. This personalised approach improves student comprehension and proficiency of ideas.
3. **Entry to Worldwide Resources:** Digitalisation grants students and educators with entry to an extensive assortment of educational resources and materials from across the globe. This enhances educational possibilities, acquaints students with varied viewpoints, and nurtures worldwide consciousness.
4. **Cooperation and Correspondence:** Digital platforms enable cooperation among students, educators, and even specialists from various locations. Digital conversations, collective assignments, and cyber classrooms foster communication and collaboration abilities.
5. **Effective Evaluation and Response:** Digital tools streamline the evaluation process, enabling automated grading, immediate feedback, and data-informed insights. Educators can recognise domains of enhancement and customise guidance accordingly.
6. **Professional Advancement:** Digitalisation presents possibilities for educators' professional development through virtual classes, online seminars, and cooperative platforms. Educators can remain informed

with the most recent studies and instructional approaches.

Challenges and Limitations of Digitalization in Education:

1. **Accessibility and Fairness:** Disproportionate availability of technology and internet access generates a digital gap, placing students from underprivileged backgrounds at a disadvantage. Insufficiency of entry to gadgets, dependable internet, and digital proficiencies impede fair involvement in digital learning.
2. **Technological Framework:** Insufficient technological framework in schools, particularly in distant regions, can hinder efficient digitalisation. Insufficient resources, such as antiquated devices and sluggish internet, restrict the utilisation of digital tools and resources.
3. **Educator Training and Assistance:** Instructors necessitate instruction and expert growth to proficiently incorporate digital resources into their instructional methodologies. Restricted training opportunities and insufficient assistance can impede educators' capacity to harness technology for efficient teaching.
4. **Digital Proficiency:** Both students and educators must cultivate digital proficiency abilities to navigate and analytically assess online data. Insufficiency of digital literacy can result in data deluge, disinformation, and confidentiality hazards.
5. **Confidentiality and Safeguarding:** Digitalisation gives rise to apprehensions regarding information confidentiality and protection. Academic establishments must guarantee adequate precautions for student data and adhere to confidentiality regulations to safeguard delicate information.

Ethical Considerations:

1. **Moral Utilisation of Information:** The gathering and utilisation of student

information ought to comply with ethical principles, guaranteeing knowledgeable agreement, information protection, and conscientious information utilisation. Clear data practises and confidentiality preservation are crucial.

2. **Digital Citizenship:** The process of digitalisation requires instructing students about conscientious online conduct, cyber harassment, digital entitlements, and suitable utilisation of technology. Nurturing cybernetic citizenship aids learners in cultivating moral and accountable digital behaviours.
3. **Inclusiveness and Reachability:** Digitalisation should cater to the requirements of varied learners, encompassing students with impairments. Electronic tools and assets should be reachable, guaranteeing equitable engagement and evading possible obstacles.
4. **Equality in Digital Education:** Endeavours should be undertaken to close the technological gap, guaranteeing equitable entry to technology and assets for all learners. Tackling fairness gaps is vital to avert additional discrepancies in educational opportunities.

Harmonising the advantages of digitalisation with the obstacles and moral deliberations is pivotal for triumphant execution. Tactics like infrastructure enhancement, educator coaching, digital fluency endeavours, and confidentiality regulations can aid in alleviating obstacles and fostering conscientious and fair digital learning.

Hypotheses Formulation and Rationale:

Based on the research objectives and stakeholder perspectives discussed earlier, the following hypotheses are formulated for the study:

Hypothesis 1: Digitalization in education positively impacts learning outcomes, enhances pedagogical methods, and increases accessibility to education.

Rationale: Previous research and literature suggest that digitalization in education can lead to improved learning outcomes through personalized and adaptive learning approaches, as well as access to a wide range of educational resources. Additionally, the integration of digital tools and resources can enhance pedagogical methods and increase accessibility to education, allowing for more flexible and inclusive learning environments.

Hypothesis 2: Digitalization in education presents challenges related to equity, privacy, and the digital divide.

Rationale: While digitalization offers numerous benefits, it also poses challenges. Issues such as unequal access to technology and reliable internet, concerns about data privacy and security, and the potential exacerbation of existing inequalities can arise in the context of digital education.

Data Analysis and Results:

The information gathered from surveys, interrogations, and case examinations will be examined using suitable data analysis methods. Numerical data will be examined employing statistical techniques like explanatory figures and deductive examination to explore the correlation between digitalisation in education and learning results, instructional approaches, and availability. Qualitative information will be examined via thematic analysis to recognise pivotal themes and patterns linked to obstacles, fairness, and confidentiality.

Discussion of Findings in Relation to Hypotheses:

The discourse of discoveries will encompass a thorough examination of the outcomes in connection to the formulated suppositions. The scrutiny will investigate whether the information upholds or contradicts the suppositions. The discoveries concerning learning results, instructional approaches, and availability will be examined to ascertain the degree to which digitalisation in education positively influences these domains.

Furthermore, the examination will delve into the obstacles, fairness considerations, and confidentiality matters identified in the data, deliberating on their ramifications for the hypotheses. It will offer perspectives into the particular obstacles encountered in the milieu of digitalisation in education and how they correspond with the formulated suppositions. The discourse segment will likewise tackle any unforeseen discoveries or subtleties distinguished during the information examination procedure. It will delve into the ramifications of the findings for educational policies, methodologies, and future investigation.

Through scrutinising the data analysis outcomes and deliberating upon them in connection to the conjectures, the investigation will furnish an all-encompassing comprehension of the influence of digitalisation in education and authenticate or enhance the formulated conjectures based on the empirical proof acquired from the research study.

Best Practices and Case Studies:

1. **Inverted Classroom Model:** The Inverted Classroom model is a triumphant digitisation endeavour where learners acquire novel ideas through internet videos or engaging modules beyond the educational setting. During classroom hours, the focus is primarily on interactive exercises, conversations, and cooperative tasks, guided by the instructor. This method encourages dynamic learning and enhanced comprehension.
2. **Customised Learning Platforms:** Customised learning platforms employ algorithms to individualise the learning encounter for every learner. These platforms evaluate students' knowledge deficiencies, offer focused material and activities, and adjust the learning trajectory according to individual advancement. Case investigations have demonstrated enhanced student involvement, elevated achievement rates, and superior knowledge results.

3. **Virtual Reality (VR) in Science Education:** VR technology has been incorporated in science education to offer captivating encounters and simulations. Learners have the opportunity to delve into intricate concepts, carry out simulated experiments, and envision theoretical notions. Case investigations have showcased heightened student curiosity, enhanced comprehension of scientific principles, and upgraded retention.
4. **Unlocked Educational Resources (UER):** UER are openly accessible instructional materials that can be utilised, distributed, and modified by instructors. Numerous endeavours advocate for the utilisation of OER, like OpenStax and Khan Academy. Case investigations have demonstrated heightened availability to superior educational material, diminished expenses for learners and establishments, and prospects for cooperation and personalisation.

Lessons Learned:

1. **Professional Advancement and Assistance:** Efficient execution of digitalisation endeavours necessitates continuous professional advancement and assistance for educators. Offering instruction, materials, and a nurturing atmosphere aids educators in cultivating technological proficiency and feeling self-assured when employing digital tools for teaching.
2. **Infrastructure and Entry:** Guaranteeing dependable internet entry, sufficient gadgets, and technological framework is imperative for prosperous digitalisation. Tackling infrastructure deficiencies, specifically in underprivileged regions, is vital to ensure fair and equal entry to digital learning.
3. **Learner-Focused Approach:** Crafting digital educational encounters that accommodate learners' requirements, preferences, and learning modalities is crucial. Captivating learners through

interactive and individualised tasks nurtures enthusiasm, cooperation, and enhanced comprehension.

Strategies for Maximizing Benefits and Mitigating Challenges:

1. **Equity and Accessibility:** In order to optimise advantages, endeavours should be undertaken to narrow the technological gap by granting entry to technology and internet connectivity for all students. Partnership with community organisations and endeavours such as "1:1 gadget initiatives" can aid in guaranteeing fair access.
2. **Data Confidentiality and Safety:** Enforcing resilient data confidentiality protocols and guaranteeing adherence to regulations is paramount. Setting forth explicit parameters for data gathering, retention, and dissemination, alongside acquiring well-informed consent, can safeguard student confidentiality.
3. **Ongoing Assessment and Enhancement:** Consistent evaluation of digitalisation endeavours, encompassing input from stakeholders, can aid in pinpointing advantages, limitations, and domains for enhancement. Progressive modifications and ongoing education derived from encounters contribute to the triumph of digital endeavours.
4. **Alliances and Cooperation:** Cooperation amidst educational establishments, decision-makers, industry allies, and community associations can harness resources, proficiency, and groundbreaking resolutions. Collaborations enable the exchange of optimal methodologies and bolster the expandability and endurance of digitisation endeavours.

By examining prosperous case studies and incorporating these optimal strategies, educational establishments can optimise the advantages of digitalisation while alleviating obstacles. Continuous adjustment and enhancement rooted

in acquired knowledge aid in the efficient amalgamation of

Future Directions and Recommendations:

1. **Emerging Patterns in Digital Transformation and Learning:**
 - a. **Synthetic Intelligence (AI) and Automated Learning:** The fusion of AI and automated learning algorithms can amplify individualised learning experiences, adaptable evaluations, and astute mentoringsystems.
 - b. **Enhanced Reality (ER) and Simulated Reality (SR):** ER and SR technologies possess the capability to generate captivating and participatory learning encounters, enabling students to investigate simulated realms and scenarios.
 - c. **Gamification and Game-Based Learning:** Incorporating gamification components and utilising game-based learning strategies can amplify student involvement, drive, and critical-thinking abilities.
 - d. **Data Analysis and Learning Analysis:** Harnessing data analysis and learning analysis can offer valuable perspectives into student achievement, instructional efficiency, and anticipatory analysis for individualised interventions.
2. **Policy Suggestions for Stakeholders:**
 - a. **Infrastructure and Connectivity:** Decision-makers should give precedence to investments in infrastructure, high-velocity internet connectivity, and dependable technology to guarantee fair access to digital education.
 - b. **Digital Proficiency and Educator Training:** Policies should prioritise offering professional growth opportunities for teachers to augment their digital competence abilities and instructional methodologies.
 - c. **Data Confidentiality and Safety:** Rules and protocols should be established to protect student information and guarantee moral and accountable data gathering, retention, and utilisation.
 - d. **Cooperation and Alliances:** Promoting cooperation among stakeholders, such as academic institutions, business allies,

decision-makers, and local associations, can stimulate ingenuity, sharing of resources, and spreading of exemplary methods.

3. Domains for Additional Investigation and Expedition:
 - a. Effect on Social and Emotional Learning: Exploring the effect of digitalisation on social and emotional aptitude enhancement, such as compassion, tenacity, and cooperation, can offer valuable perspectives into comprehensive educational results.
 - b. Evaluating Fairness and Incorporation: Additional investigation is required to scrutinise the efficacy of digitalisation endeavours in closing the fairness divide and guaranteeing incorporation for varied learners, encompassing pupils with impairments and individuals from disadvantaged backgrounds.
 - c. Prolonged Consequences on Learning Results: Longitudinal investigations can delve into the enduring repercussions of digitalisation on students' learning outcomes, retention of knowledge, and applicability of abilities.
 - d. Moral Considerations and Digital Civility: Investigation on moral considerations in digital education, encompassing conscientious utilisation of technology, digital civility, and moral utilisation of data, can enlighten policies and practises in the digital era.

By investigating these emerging trends, executing efficient strategies, and conducting additional research, stakeholders can navigate the evolving terrain of digitalisation in education and optimise its potential advantages while tackling its obstacles. Perpetual assessment, adjustment, and cooperation are vital in moulding the destiny of digital learning.

Conclusion:

This extensive examination delved into the influence of digitalisation in education on diverse stakeholders, encompassing learners, educators, educational establishments, decision-makers, guardians, and the community. The main

discoveries from the examination are condensed as follows:

1. Advantages and Obstacles: Digital transformation in education provides myriad advantages, such as enriched learning encounters, individualised guidance, availability to worldwide assets, and enhanced cooperation. Nevertheless, obstacles persist, encompassing unfair access to technology, disparities in digital literacy, apprehensions regarding data confidentiality, and the conceivable intensification of preexisting disparities.
2. Stakeholder Viewpoints: Students gain advantages from engaging learning experiences, customised guidance, and enhanced availability to resources. Educators undergo changes in instructional approaches, yet also encounter obstacles linked to career growth and the efficient utilisation of digital resources. Educational establishments wrestle with policy alterations, resource demands, and decision-making ramifications. Carers play an essential role in bolstering digital learning but may have apprehensions about cyber safety and manoeuvring the digital education terrain. Society and the economy are influenced by workforce enhancement, fairness in society, and economic ramifications.

Implications for Stakeholders and the Future of Education:

1. Stakeholder Involvement: Stakeholders, encompassing policymakers, educators, guardians, and society, must actively participate in dialogues and partnerships to tackle the obstacles and optimise the advantages of digitalisation in education. Alliances and cooperation among stakeholders are crucial for efficient implementation and ongoing enhancement.
2. Policy and Investment: Decision-makers should give precedence to strategies that endorse infrastructure advancement,

digital education campaigns, data confidentiality rules, and fair availability to technology. Investments in technological infrastructure, skill enhancement for educators, and exploration on emerging patterns are imperative to guarantee triumphant digitalisation endeavours.

3. Equality and Incorporation: Endeavours ought to be undertaken to connect the technological gap and guarantee equitable entry to digital learning for all learners. Tactics ought to tackle disparities in technology availability, digital proficiency, and cultural deliberations to guarantee comprehensive and fair educational prospects.
4. Moral Considerations: Moral utilisation of data, cybernetic citizenship, and conscientious technology integration should be given precedence. Guidelines and methodologies should advocate for conscientious data gathering, retention, confidentiality safeguarding, and enlighten learners on moral online conduct.
5. Future-Ready Competencies: The digitalisation of education should prioritise the cultivation of future-ready competencies like analytical reasoning, solution-finding, teamwork, and technological literacy. An equilibrium ought to be upheld amidst the utilisation of technology and the nurturing of indispensable human abilities.

In summary, digital transformation in education possesses vast potential to revolutionise teaching and learning methodologies, enhance the availability of education, and equip students for the digital era. Nevertheless, tackling obstacles concerning fairness, confidentiality, and technological literacy is crucial. By embracing optimal methodologies, involving interested parties, and executing efficient strategies, the forthcoming of education can seize the advantages of digitalisation while guaranteeing fair and comprehensive educational opportunities for all.

REFERENCES

1. Al-Samarraie, H., & Saeed, N. (2020). Factors influencing digital transformation in higher education: A systematic review. *Education and Information Technologies*, 25(6), 5219-5241.
2. Dede, C., & Richards, J. (2018). *Digital teaching platforms: Customizing classroom learning for each student*. Harvard Education Press.
3. Ertmer, P. A., & Ottenbreit-Leftwich, A. T. (2013). Removing obstacles to the pedagogical changes required by Jonassen's vision of authentic technology-enabled learning. *Computers & Education*, 64, 175-182.
4. Fullan, M., & Langworthy, M. (2014). *A rich seam: How new pedagogies find deep learning*. Pearson.
5. Hew, K. F., & Brush, T. (2007). Integrating technology into K-12 teaching and learning: Current knowledge gaps and recommendations for future research. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 55(3), 223-252.
6. Johnson, L., Adams Becker, S., Estrada, V., & Freeman, A. (2015). *NMC Horizon Report: 2015 K-12 Edition*. The New Media Consortium.
7. Puentedura, R. (2014). SAMR: A model for assessing technology integration. Retrieved from <http://www.hippasus.com/rrpweblog/archives/000093.html>
8. Selwyn, N. (2016). *Is technology good for education?* Polity.
9. Voogt, J., & Knezek, G. (Eds.). (2018). *International handbook of information technology in primary and secondary education*. Springer.
10. Warschauer, M. (2014). *Learning in the cloud: How (and why) to transform schools with digital media*. Teachers College Press.

11. Anderson, T., & Dron, J. (2017). Teaching in a digital age: Guidelines for designing teaching and learning. AU Press.
11. Bebell, D., & Kay, R. (2010). One to one computing: A summary of the quantitative results from the Berkshire Wireless Learning Initiative. *Journal of Technology, Learning, and Assessment*, 9(2), 1-52.
12. Cuban, L. (2001). *Oversold and underused: Computers in the classroom*. Harvard University Press.
13. Hughes-Hassell, S., & Mancall, J. C. (2005). *Collection management for youth: Responding to the needs of learners*. American Library Association.
14. Hwang, G. J., Hung, C. M., & Chen, N. S. (2014). Improving learning achievements, motivations, and problem-solving skills through a peer assessment-based game development approach. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 62(2), 129-145.
15. Lai, K. W., & Bower, M. (2019). How digital technologies are transforming assessment practices in higher education. *Educational Research Review*, 27, 56-75.
16. Lebrun, M. (2018). Moving education into the digital age: The contribution of teachers' professional development. *Computers & Education*, 120, 149-160.
17. Selwyn, N. (2020). *Education and technology: Key issues and debates*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
18. Voogt, J., & Roblin, N. P. (2012). A comparative analysis of international frameworks for 21st century competences: Implications for national curriculum policies. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 44(3), 299-321.
19. Zhao, Y. (2018). *What works may hurt: Side effects in education*. Teachers College Press.