

Evaluation of Natural Face Makeup Training Inteller and Customer Service Bank

Ulfa Nursaid¹, Soeprijanto², Jenny Sista Siregar³

^{1, 2, 3}Technology and Vocational Education Study Program, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

This evaluation research uses qualitative descriptive techniques to provide an overview of natural makeup training for Bank Of Republic Indonesia (BRI) Teller and Customer Service. The evaluation model is the four-stage Kirkpatrick model. The research was conducted at BRI KC and CP Pondok Melati, Bekasi using questionnaires and interviews to collect data from BRI Teller and Customer Services, BRI Management representatives, organizers, and training instructors. Natural makeup training was organized by BRI for frontliners to answer BRI's needs for the appearance of its employees to provide excellent service. BRI Customer Service makeup must look natural but still up to date and according to BRI frontliner grooming standards. The results of data tabulation show that almost all (78%) of respondents' answers show a positive assessment of the training where 41% rated Good and 37% rated Very Good natural makeup training for BRI Teller and Customer Services. However, there is a small portion (6%) who gave a negative assessment of this training with a level of 1% Very Unfavorable and 5% Unfavorable. From these results, the training was rated Good and even Excellent in the four stages of the Kirkpatrick Model evaluation by almost all trainees.

Keywords: *Evaluation, Natural Makeup Training, Teller, and Customer Services Bank*

Introduction

The appearance of tellers and customer service is always associated with their professional image as frontliners at the bank and then linked to the quality of their work in hiring customers. Angeline (2013) states, the company's image is indirectly reflected in the appearance of its employees ... Professionalism includes interpersonal skills, individual attitudes, and appearance. Service quality is an essence that is very important for the survival of the banking business. The principle of "service excellent" is the standard for banks in providing services carried out by setting high quality standards and always following the development of customer needs consistently, accurately and reliably. The physical appearance of personnel is one of the indicators of measuring service quality with the SERVQUAL scale from the Tangibles dimension (Zaid, 2021).

Bank Rakyat Indonesia (BRI) as one of the largest state-owned enterprises owned by the Indonesian government also demands that its employees provide excellent service by having professionalism at work through their banking skills or skills and are required to have a beautiful and attractive appearance. The use of makeup in addition to job requirements to maintain appearance "makeup is able to make it look more beautiful and charming" (Martha, 2013) which is used to get a professional impression or image. "The appearance of a bank teller must reflect a professional appearance because banks are a business of trust" (IBI, 2016). Based on this, it can be said that customer trust also requires support from its appearance. Customer trust and loyalty to the services offered by the bank are the implications of the professional appearance of employees so that they can convince, guarantee, and provide a sense of security and comfort.

BRI sets BRI Frontliner Grooming Standards as a specific standard for appearance in general that is used in Teller and Costumer Service officers. To achieve this standard of appearance for its employees, BRI provides beauty class training to every employee who has just been accepted to work and is undergoing a training period. In practice, BRI management cooperates with third parties in organizing beauty class training "BRI Frontliner Grooming Standards". The results of the initial interview with one of the frontliner staff can be concluded if the training method used is the demonstration method with the material taught is the use of cosmetics and make-up according to the SOP. It is known that beauty class training so far has no evaluation of beauty class training.

Teller and Customer Service in providing excellent service are needed by customers who come directly to get professional services but with a touch of "humanity" (IBI, 2016). To provide excellent service, they really need to pay attention to their appearance. These frontliners are important to build positive customer perceptions" (Yusron, 2017). Beautiful and attractive appearance can create a positive image / perception of the customer or in terms of other employees and even the company. This positive image can create a good and positive initial perception that can be used to influence the behavior of other people or organizations towards themselves / organizations either as individuals or as bank employees / company representatives.

BRI Teller and Customer Service makeup is a type of natural style makeup but elegant and durable. Natural makeup is a form of makeup that makes the face look beautiful and fresh like not using makeup (Maybelline, n.d). This makeup has a fairly complicated technique because it must produce makeup that looks natural, not flashy so that it looks like you are not using makeup. The difficulty increases with the application of the provisions in BRI makeup. For this reason, BRI Teller and Customer Service require this makeup training. Salas, et.al (2012) revealed, "These training and development activities allow organizations to adapt, compete, excel, innovate, produce, be safe, improve service, and reach goals". Beauty class training is very useful to support the performance of BRI Teller and Customer Service services on the other hand it is a tool for BRI to meet the needs of the appearance of its frontliners. Therefore, the beauty class training activities require evaluation to determine the effectiveness of activities in achieving the main objectives of the training, namely that each personnel are able to meet BRI appearance standards so that organizational goals are achieved. The Kirkpatrick evaluation method is used, which is a training evaluation method carried out at four levels: Reaction, Learning, Behavior, and Result.

Compared to other evaluation methods, the Kirkpatrick evaluation model has advantages, namely 1) more accurate in providing data availability 2) more comprehensive because it includes hard skills and soft skills skills where the objects evaluated are not only learning outcomes but also include output processes and outcomes and are relatively easy to implement (Marjuki, 2022).

The success of beauty class training is not only seen from the output but also can analyze how the training process includes people and all aspects involved in it. For this reason, an evaluation of natural makeup training needs to be carried out so that the achievement of training objectives can be optimized.

Problem Formulation

1. What is the standard appearance of bank tellers and customer service set by BRI?
2. How is the BRI beauty class training model described?
3. What is the description of natural makeup training for BRI Teller and Customer Service in terms of reaction, learning, attitude, and results?

Theoretical Review

Evaluation according to Bloom in Daryanto (2010) "evaluation, as we see it is the systematic collection of evidence to determine whether in fact certain changes are taking place in the learners as well as to determine the amount or degree of change in individual students", Stufflebeam in Daryanto (2010) "Evaluation is the process of delineating, obtaining, and providing useful information for judging decision alternatives".

Herwina (2021) summarizes training as an activity that aims to make employees more skilled and more productive. The training material by Susanto (2010) is classified into 2 (two) types, namely:

1. Discourse Training (Knowledge Based Training): introduces a new discourse that must be socialized to trainees with the aim of increasing the achievement of the goals of a person, group, organization, or institution.
2. Skill Based Training: introducing or deepening the skills of a person, group, organization, or institution both technically (hard skills) and non-technically which is more about personal development (soft skills).

The Kirkpatrick model focuses on Reaction, Learning, Behavior, and Result.

1. Reaction measures a participant's reaction to the application of materials or programs, trainers, facilities, place, and time of training. Kirkpatrick (2008) in Ambiyar and Muharika (2019) states, Evaluation of

reaction is the same thing as measuring customer satisfaction. Training is effective if the trainees react well. If not, they are not motivated to learn.

2. Learning measures what has been learned during the learning process in training which is the transfer of knowledge. In Ambiyar and Muharika (2019) according to Kirkpatrick (2008), there are three things that can be taught in training programs, namely knowledge, attitudes and skills.
3. Behavior, the stage that measures the impact of changes in behavior (behavior level) in everyday life. Evaluation of behavior is focused on the work behavior of trainees after they return to their work environment. The behavior referred to here is work behavior that is directly related to the training material, and not behavior in the context of personal relationships with colleagues Kirkpatrick (2008) in Ambiyar and Muharika (2019).
4. Result/outcome describes the overall outcome of the application of learning activities. Kirkpatrick (2008) asserts that outcomes can be defined as the final results that occur because participants follow the program. Evaluation of results in level 4 is focused on the results that occur because students have followed a learning program.

Makeup with this style is commonly called natural makeup or can also be called no makeup-makeup look. ... no makeup-makeup look shows a face like not wearing makeup, but still there must be makeup products used to make the face look more perfect (Thalia and Elda, 2018). This makeup is also often equated with light makeup Tagai K., et al (2017). The makeup look is as shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Female Models with No Makeup, Light Makeup, and Heavy Makeup

Research Methodology

The type of research is evaluation research with the Donald model evaluation model. L. Kirkpatrick (1959) model. The research was conducted from December 2020 to completion at BRI Branch Offices and Sub-Branched in Pondok Melati, Bekasi using survey methods (29 Teller and Costumers Services) and interviews (BRI Management, Training Organizers, and Instructors) to collect data. The results of the data were analyzed using qualitative descriptive analysis techniques.

1. Reaction stage (Reaction) aspects are Materials, Methods, Facilities, and Instructor/trainer.
2. Learning stage (Learning) aspects are Knowledge, Understanding and, Application
3. Behavior stage, the aspects are Application of training materials and Development of knowledge and skills
4. Result stage, the aspects are Knowledge and Skills, Motivation and Performance.

Research Results And Discussion

From the data obtained, it is known that BRI tellers or customer services out of 29 respondents in this study mostly have an age range between 23-24 years, 10 respondents (34%), 20 respondents (69%) of whom have a formal educational background of S1 (undergraduate), 19 respondents (66%) are contract employees, and 13 respondents (45%) have a tenure of 3 years and above. Evaluation Data of Natural Makeup Training for Teller and Customer Service BRI From the calculation results for the reaction stage, it is known that the frequency of respondents who rated Very Not Good was 5 (1%), Not Good the frequency was 10 (3%), Undecided 64 (18%), Good 146 (42%), and very good 123 (35%). So, most of them reacted well to the training.

Learning stages based on the results of the calculation it is known if there are no (0%) respondents who rate very Not Good, but those who rate Not Good the frequency is 22 (8%), Indecisive assessment the frequency is 33 (13%), Good assessment the frequency is 99 (38%), Very Good assessment the frequency is 107 (41%). So that the results of the evaluation of natural makeup training for BRI tellers and customer services for the learning stage in the Kirkpatrick evaluation method are that most (41%) respondents gave very good scores, and none (0%) respondents gave very unfavorable ratings.

The results of the evaluation of the Kirkpatrick model of the behavior stage as shown in Table 4.9 the frequency of those who rated Very Poor was 2 (2%), Not Good the frequency was 5 (4%), Undecided the frequency was 18 (16%), Good the frequency was 43 (37%), Very Good the frequency was 48 (41%). These results show that most respondents (41%) rated Very Good the ability of this natural makeup training in changing the behavior of respondents so that it is in accordance with the work culture expected by BRI. At the results stage there is a frequency of 1 (1%) who rated Very Not Good, Not Good 6 (4%), who rated Doubtful the frequency was 25 (17%), Good 64 (45%) and Very Good the frequency was 48 (33%).

Almost all respondents (77%) rated the materials, methods, facilities and instructors positively and very positively during the natural makeup training. Respondents were satisfied and even very satisfied because these aspects were considered to meet the expectations and needs of the training participants. The natural makeup training material, both in terms of time and content, was designed to adopt BRI's needs for the appearance of its frontliners. In this makeup training, the method used is to modify several learning methods, namely presentation, demonstration, and practice methods. Daluba, Ekeyi (2013) states, The demonstration method used in this study was activity oriented and encouraged student - teacher, student - student and student - material interactions. The activity nature of the teaching method made the students to provide relevant answers to the ASAT questions than their counterparts in the control group, which was not exposed to the activity-based method (Daluba, Ekeyi, 2013).

Nurlia (2020) stated that facilities are also an important element of training implementation that must be evaluated because the condition of training facilities greatly affects the comfort of participants in participating in learning ... the credibility of a training institution is seen from its facilities. Budi, Yusuf, and Aritonang (2019) showed that training facilities have a direct positive effect on the quality of student outcomes. Dzisyse and Ila (2019) prove that there is a relationship between instructor competence (pedagogic, personality, professional, and social) and learning outcomes.

If interpreted from the results of the calculation, almost half of the respondents (79%) who rated positively (Very Good and Good) and only a small percentage (8%) were negative (Very Unfavorable and Not Good) towards the learning stage in the training. The results of this makeup training are mainly to improve the skills of participants in applying makeup according to BRI frontliner grooming standards so that they can meet the needs of the company or can also be applied at certain events, this is often said to be an improvement in knowledge, and or the addition of participant skills. In addition, after completing the program, it is also expected to improve mental attitude (attitude) so that it can follow the work culture at BRI.

At the Behavior stage, the frequency of respondents' answers who rated positively was 78% or almost entirely with the level of Very Good 41% and Good 37%. While those who answered negatively were 6% of the frequency or only a small proportion. These results can be assumed if this training by almost all respondents is considered good or even very good in changing the behavior of participants so that they are able to apply the training material and develop the knowledge and skills gained during the training. Although there were 2% of respondents who gave a very unfavorable rating and 4% of them also rated it unfavorable. This indicates that if there are a small number of respondents who rate not good or even very bad on changes in their behavior, for example, making them able to apply the results of the training, namely the entire process in applying natural makeup according to the SOP with BRI appearance standards. The expected behavior of the training results is the ability of the participants to apply the entire natural makeup process according to the SOP with the selection of cosmetic colors that match the skin by paying attention to BRI frontliner grooming standards and repeating makeup exercises at home so that when they return to their work environment, they can apply the natural makeup knowledge. To be able to provide better and effective meaning as a result of learning in terms

of expected behavioral changes, it is also necessary (1) the commitment of the leadership to adhere to the principles in organizing training, (2) the material designed must be the needs of the participants, and (3) provide rewards and punishments (Ahmad, 2020).

At the Result Stage, the frequency of respondents' answers shows that 45% rated Good and 33% rated Very Good, which means that almost all (78%) gave positive answers and only 5% gave negative answers. These results indicate that almost all participants assess the results of this training can improve their knowledge and skills, motivation and encourage their performance as BRI Teller and Customer Services. Dabuke¹, Andre Mantha, Veithzal Zainal and, Hakim (2023) in their research stated, In achieving organizational goals, companies must be able to create situations and conditions, such as encouraging and allowing employees to develop work abilities and build a sense of self-confidence so that employees can work optimally.

Furthermore, it is necessary to use internal marketing practices, such as the continuous training of front-line employees. This will ensure that bank employees who have to communicate with customers will have a good understanding of the importance of their appearance and their behavior in providing customer service. (Lymperopoulos and Chaniotakis, 2018).

This natural makeup training is expected to increase knowledge and improve the skills of the participants who are BRI employees in the frontliner section, namely Teller or Customer Service. This knowledge and skills are expected to improve the performance of Teller or Customer Service in providing excellent service. Skills have a positive and significant effect on employee performance (Masnun, Muhammad, Supriyanto, 2022).

BRI Teller and Customer Service Appearance Standards

Teller and Customer Services makeup standards are: makeup that is naturally beautiful but elegant and can last long so that it creates a fresh impression, using unobtrusive cosmetic colors. To socialize the provisions in the appearance, BRI makes BRI frontliner grooming standards contained in the Frontliner Grooming Standard video. The makeup and hair requirements for frontliners are as follows.

- a. Hair beyond the shoulders must be formally plaited and bangs are side pinned.
- b. Hair above the shoulders is not required to be plaited, bangs are side pinned
- c. Hair color must look natural, no flashy colors/ highlights
- d. Use natural & unobtrusive color make-up
- e. Make-up that must be worn is lipstick, blush, powder, eyebrows, eyeliner, eyeshadow and mascara (BRI Frontliner Grooming Standards, 2022).

BRI Beauty Class Training Model

Natural makeup training conducted by BRI for Teller and Customer Services is carried out in two categories, namely: training for new employees (accepted) and training for employees who have been working for a while. For training held for new employees is mandatory and for old employees who are socialization. For new employees, training activities are held for five days, at Corporate University Lembang which is located at: Jl. Raya Lembang No.436 - 438, Lembang, Kec. Lembang, West Bandung Regency, West Java 40391. While the training that is socialization of make up is held for a certain moment with the participants being BRI Branch Office or Sub-Branch frontliners who hold the training. Usually conducted for only one day at the hall located at the BRI Branch Office or Sub-Branch. Series of activities during makeup training:

1. The initial activity is filled with opening, prayers, self-introduction of participants and instructors (absent), followed by a briefing on the objectives of the training and the training methods that will be used. Then together prepare the participants can be divided into groups (if there are many participants) and prepare tools and materials and cosmetics that will be used for training.
2. Core activities
 - a) Provide an explanation of: Frontliner Grooming Standards, makeup SOP, types and functions of each cosmetic or tool, facial correction, tips on choosing cosmetic colors to match skin tone.
 - b) The instructor conducts a makeup demonstration to the model. Demonstrations are carried out while demonstrating the instructor provides explanations and emphasis related to tricks when using cosmetics /

tools so that they can correct the face. And the selection of cosmetic colors that match the skin color but do not violate grooming standards.

c) Makeup practice

Participants apply makeup to themselves based on the examples given. The instructor observes the process while reminding them about the SOP of makeup and grooming standards.

3. Termination activity

a) Emphasize frontliner grooming standards and makeup SOPs

b) Provide opportunities for participants to ask questions

c) Choosing the three best participants to be rewarded

d) Evaluate the training by asking for feedback from participants

Conclusions

For the Reaction Stage, almost all respondents had a Good (42%) and Very Good (35%) level of satisfaction with the material, methods, facilities and instructor aspects obtained during the natural makeup training. Stage Learning respondents who rated Good (38%) Very Good (41%) so that almost all respondents assessed that this makeup training could improve the skills, knowledge of participants in applying makeup according to BRI frontliner grooming standards. For the Behavior Stage, 43% rated Good and 48% rated Very Good so that, almost all of them considered that the training could be good and even very good in changing their behavior so that it was in accordance with the expected work culture of BRI. At the results stage, 45% answered good and 33% answered very good. If interpreted, almost all respondents assessed that training could improve their knowledge and skills, motivation, and performance. The results of data tabulation show that almost all (78%) of respondents' answers show a positive assessment of training where 41% rated Good and 37% rated Very Good natural makeup training for BRI Teller and Customer Services. However, there is a small portion (6%) who gave a negative assessment of this training with a level of 1% Very Unfavorable and 5% Unfavorable. From these results, the training was rated Good and even Excellent in the four stages of the Kirkpatrick Model evaluation by almost all trainees.

References

- [1] Ambiyar dan Muharika. (2019). *Metodologi Penelitian Evaluasi Program*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- [2] Angeline, Mia. (2013) Image Does Matter Personal Style Vs Professional Image. *Humaniora Vol.4 No.2 Oktober 2013: 747-754*
- [3] Dabuke1, Andre Mantha., Veithzal Rivai Zainal dan, Azis Hakim. (2023). The Effect of Self-Ability and Self Confidence on Employee Performance: A Literature Review. *Jurnal DIJDBM Vol. 4, No. 2, February 2023 e-ISSN: 2715-4203, p-ISSN: 2715-419X DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31933/dijdbm.v4i2>, Received: 23 December 2022, Revised: 14 January 2023, Publish: 20 February2023, pp: 286-296. Diakses <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>*
- [4] Dabuke1, Andre Mantha., Veithzal Rivai Zainal dan, Azis Hakim. (2023). The Effect of Self-Ability and Self Confidence on Employee Performance: A Literature Review. *Jurnal DIJDBM Vol. 4, No. 2, February 2023 e-ISSN: 2715-4203, p-ISSN: 2715-419X DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31933/dijdbm.v4i2>, Received: 23 December 2022, Revised: 14 January 2023, Publish: 20 February2023, pp: 286-296. Diakses <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>*
- [5] Daluba, Noah Ekeyi, 2013. Effect of Demonstration Method of Teaching on Students' Achievement in Agricultural Science. *World Journal of Education Vol. 3, No. 6; 2013. ISSN 1925-0746 E-ISSN 1925-0754, www.sciedu.ca/wje*
- [6] Daluba, Noah Ekeyi, 2013. Effect of Demonstration Method of Teaching on Students' Achievement in Agricultural Science. *World Journal of Education Vol. 3, No. 6; 2013. ISSN 1925-0746 E-ISSN 1925-0754, www.sciedu.ca/wje*
- [7] Daryanto. (2010). *Evaluasi Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.

- [8] Dzisye H dan Ila (2019). Hubungan Kompetensi Instruktur dengan Hasil Belajar Peserta Pelatihan Pengolahan Ikan Air Tawar. *Journal of Nonformal Education and Community Empowerment Volume 3 (1): 59-66, Juni 2019. DOI: 10.15294/pls.v3i1.30884. Available at <http://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jnfc>*
- [9] Fauzi Ahmad, 2020. Signifikansi Perubahan Sikap Perilaku (Behavior) Dalam Proses Kediklatan. *Jurnal Kebijakan Publik, Volume 11, Nomor 1, Maret 2020, hlm. 1-58*
- [10] Herwina, W (2021). *Analisis Model-model Pelatihan*. Madiun: CV Bayfa Cendekia Indonesia
- [11] IBI. (2016). *Mengelola Kualitas Layanan Perbankan*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- [12] Lymperopoulos Constantine dan Ioannis E. Chaniotakis. (2008) Price Satisfaction and Personnel Efficiency as Antecedents of Overall Satisfaction from Consumer Credit Products and Positive Word of Mouth. *Article in Journal of Financial Services Marketing 13(1) May 2008 DOI: 10.1057/fsm.2008.6*
- [13] Marjuki. (2020). *Implementasi Evaluasi KIRKPATRICK pada Pelatihan Blended Learning*. Palembang: Bening Media Publishing
- [14] Martha, Puspita. (2013). *Makeup 101 Basic Personal Makeup*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama
- [15] Masnun., Muhammad Sapruwan., dan Supriyanto. (2022) Pengaruh Pelatihan dan Keterampilan Terhadap Percaya Diri yang Berdampak pada Kinerja Karyawan. *Jurnal EMAS: Ekonomi Manajemen Akuntansi Kewirausahaan* Call for Papers dan Seminar III "Strategi Mencapai Kinerja Unggul" Fakultas Ekonomi dan Bisnis, Universitas Pelita Bangsa, Juni 2022 pp: 28-35
- [16] Nurlia. (2020). Evaluasi Kepuasan Peserta Pelatihan terhadap Kinerja Widyaiswara dan Fasilitas Pelatihan di BPSDM Aceh. *Jurnal Wacana Kinerja Volume 23 | Nomor 2 | November 2020 DOI : 10.31845/jwk.v23i2.203 p-issn : 1411-4917; e-issn : 2620-9063 <http://jwk.bandung.lan.go.id>* Peraturan Menteri Kesehatan RI No. 1176/Menkes/Per/VIII/2010 tentang Notifikasi Kosmetika
- [17] Salas., et.al (2012). The Science of Training and Development in Organizations: What Matters in Practice. *Psychological Science in the Public Interest 13(2) 74-101. DOI: 10.1177/1529100612436661. sagepub.com/journalsPermissions.nav. Diakses <http://pspi.sagepub.com>*
- [18] Santoso Budi., Yusuf., dan Sovian Aritonang (2019). Pengaruh Fasilitas Latihan Dan Kompetensi Tenaga Pendidik Terhadap Kualitas Hasil Didik Di Pusdiklathanudnas Surabaya. *Jurnal Strategi Pertahanan Udara | April 2019 | Volume 5 Nomor 1 pp: 69-74*
- [19] Santoso, Budiman. (2010). *Skema dan Mekanisme Pelatihan: Panduan Penyelenggaraan Pelatihan*. Jakarta: Yayasan Terumbu Karang Indonesia (TERANGI)
- [20] *Standar Grooming Frontliner BRI*, 2022. BRI.
- [21] Tagai K, Shimakura H, Isobe H, Nittono H (2017) The light-makeup advantage in facial processing: Evidence from event-related potentials. *PLoS ONE 12(2): e0172489. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0172489>*
- [22] Thalia, RP dan Elda Franzia. (2018) Desain Cover Majalah *Cosmogirl Indonesia*. *Jurnal Dimensi Dkv, Vol.3- No.1 April 2018, pp: 15-30*
- [23] Yusron, Ahmad. (2017) Persepsi Nasabah Terhadap Implementasi Komunikasi Pelayanan *Front Liner Bni Cabang Pembantu Pekalipan Cirebon. Jurnal SOSFILKOM Vol. XI No. 01 Tahun 2017, hal: 56-64. ISSN 2686-0368. Diakses <http://e-journal.umc.ac.id/index.php/DFK> pada Febuari 2022.*
- [24] Zaid, SM. 2021. *Ekuitas Merek dan Advokasi Pelanggan Melalui Strategi Gamifikasi dan Kualitas Pelayanan*. Lamongan: Academia Publication